THE CLOSE OF THE INVERSTITURE CONTROVERSY

Scripture: Matthew 22:15-22
Prayer
Hymn: 406 "I Love Thy kingdom, Lord"

The First Crusade provided for Pope Urban II much needed relief from the Investiture Controversy. The Holy War diverted attention from the old struggle. King Henry IV and his pope, Wibert (ClementIII), could not match the popular appeal of the crusade. The crusade lifted Urban at once to a position of European leadership. Urban's papacy which had begun under such unpromising circumstances turned out to be one of the most important in medieval history. The pope had actually become the personal leader of all Christendom. The crusade became a much bigger thing than Urban had envisioned. Urban himself continued to work to centralize power in the papacy. He created primates, made extensive use of legates, and took direct personal action. He stiffened discipline, claiming jurisdiction over monasteries. He renewed the decrees against simony and against investiture and homage to lay lords. He held a council at Bari in 1093 in which the procession of the Holy Spirit from the Father and from the Son was defined.

The crusade had not long detracted attention from Investiture. The subject of the relation of church and state brought a flood of pamphleteers from both sides and public attention was again centered on the old controversy. Henry IV employed a jurist of Ravenna, Peter Crassus, to defend his cause in terms of Roman law. Manegold of Lautenbach supported the papacy, defining the state as a contract between ruler and ruled, and declaring that if the ruler proved a tyrant he forfeited the dignity given him by the people. Champions of the state dug up Charlemagne's admonitions to the pope to stick to the business of preaching and teaching the heathen. One writer put strange emphasis on the Scriptures as God's word that sounded like later Protestantism: "We have all the prophetic writings and the apostolic gospels in which all the commands of God are contained, and of these, we have a fuller knowledge than he (the pope).

Guy of Ferrara (c. 1086) and Ivo, bishop of Chartres from 1090, called for a compromise between church and state. The canonlaw to which the pope's supporters appealed and developed before the feudal framework from which the king's backers argued. Bishops and abbots were feudal landholders as well as officers in the church. According to feudal custom office and lands were received from the feudal lord accompanied by homage with an oath of fealty. The Reformers were challenging lay appointment to spiritual office. Guy and Ivo were calling for a compromise that recognized a distinction between the spiritual office and the temporal fief.

When Conrad, the oldest son of Henry IV, revolted against his father in 1093, he was supported by Urban II and welcomed to Italy where he took the oath of fealty to the pope.

Urban, the French pope, died in 1099.

THE STRUGGLE BETWEEN POPE PASchal II AND KING HENRY V:

Urban was succeeded by Cardinal Rainier, an Italian monk, who took the name of Paschal II (1099-1118). Paschal began his pontificate by condemning lay investiture. Henry, second son of Henry IV, revolted against his father in 1104. In 1105, the German feudal princes elected young Henry as Henry V, king in his father's place. Many of the towns were loyal to Henry IV. Civil War broke out that lasted until the death of Henry IV at Liege in 1106. The church refused to allow Henry IV to be buried in consecrated ground. Finally in 1111 the church permitted his body to be buried beneath the choir of the cathedral of Speyer. Henry V uncannnonically appointed his own bishops. Paschal II at the Council of Troyes (1107) reiterated his condemnation of lay investiture.

Henry V came to Rome seeking imperial coronation. Paschal II proposed a novel solution to the investiture problem. If it had worked it would have accomplished what the Reformers wished to achieve and would have revolutionized the religious and social fabric of Europe. It would have lifted the church out of the control
of lay power and out of the clutches of mammon. The proposal was that the church renounce its claim to all properties received from the king and the king should renounce his right to investiture. Henry accepted the pope's offer. In February, 1111, Henry renounced investiture and the pope renounced the temporal regalia. A storm of protest broke in St. Peter's and quickly became a riot. Neither bishops nor lay lords would allow the pact. Such a pact would have reduced the church to poverty. No bishop nor abbot was willing to make such a sacrifice of his worldly goods and no lay lord wanted to give up the fiefs he held from the church, nor did they want to see the power and wealth of the king strengthened by the return of such vast amounts of property from the church. Henry V took pope and cardinals prisoners. In April, 1111, Paschal weakened and resigned to Henry investiture with ring and staff, and crowned him Emperor. The Reform party raised a storm of protest. At the Lenten synod in Rome in March 1112, Paschal withdrew his agreement, including the concession of investiture to Henry, claiming that his concessions had been extracted by force and had been granted out of fear and therefore were not binding. In September, 1112, in a synod in Vienne, with the pope's approval, Henry was excommunicated and forbidden lay investiture. Henry had so many troubles in Germany from his troublesome subjects that he was not able to invade Rome until 1116. Pope Paschal retreated. Henry returned to Germany. Paschal returned to Rome where he died in 1118. His successor, Gelasius II, died after about a year in office. The cardinals chose the imperious Gregorius, Calixtus II, archbishop of Vienne, as the new pope.

THE SETTLEMENT OF THE INVESTITURE IN ENGLAND BETWEEN HENRY I AND ANSELM:

William the Conqueror made himself supreme in England and laid claim to all the land. He introduced the French feudal system. He tightened and centralized the royal power but left local government much as it had been. He Normanized the church replacing the Saxon clergy with Normans, replacing the Saxon with Latin, and separating the church from secular affairs. He imported the higher culture of the Continent and linked England with the Continent. An important part of his tight control was the Domesday Book of 1086, a minute census of people and things. Eighty-four percent of the rural population were unfree serfs. Thirteen percent were freemen or small landholders. The remainder—one man in thirty—composed the feudal aristocracy of great vassals and lesser vassals and high church officials. A few townsmen and some of the lower clergy were not included. William the Conqueror was careful not to break with Pope Gregory VII. He owed Gregory a debt for approving the conquest of England. William cooperated with Gregory in his efforts to reform the clergy. He kept the appointing power in his own hands but selected Normans of quality to replace Saxon bishops and abbots. He helped take the church out of politics by removing the bishop from the shire court and by setting up separate church courts to handle ecclesiastical matters. William declared that no papal decree had validity in England without the King's consent. Gregory VII was too busy with Henry IV to quarrel with William. William had the able cooperation of the noted Italian scholar, Lanfranc, who had been abbot of Bec. He was not a "yes man". Once he had so opposed William as Duke of Normandy that William had ordered him into exile. Lanfranc had only a lame horse for the journey. Overtaken by William who was angry over his slow departure, Lanfranc retorted, "Give me a better horse and I shall go quicker." William the Conqueror took Lanfranc to England and made him Archbishop of Canterbury. Lanfranc labored faithfully to improve the quality of the church in England and was perfectly willing for William to be supreme in everything. The Norman monastery at Bec had been a center of intellectual activity. Lanfranc filled English churches and monasteries with able scholars. The creative side of Norman culture found its most prominent early expression in architecture—in great cathedrals and abbeys. The Bayeux Tapestry is a unique artistic record of the conquest of 1066.
William the Conqueror died in Normandy in 1187 during a raid against the French king. Thieving servants robbed his body, which was left unburied for days, while everyone was looking after his own interests. William in his will left England to his second son, William Rufus. He left Normandy to the easy-going Robert, the eldest son. Henry, the third son, was given money. Robert borrowed money from William Rufus to go on the First Crusade. William Rufus put down revolting barons and made himself master of England and Normandy. Robert returned from the Crusade penniless. William Rufus made the unscrupulous Ranulf Flambard, bishop of Durham, his chief advisor. William Rufus ruled with an iron hand and was notorious for his unjust taxation and the corruption of his courts. Churches and abbeys were left vacant so that he might pocket the revenues. He kept the archbishopric of Canterbury vacant four years, Appropriating the income. On his sickbed, fearing death, he called Anselm, abbot of Bec, to become Archbishop of Canterbury. Anselm was loyal to the pope and to reform and soon clashed with the king. William Rufus regretted the appointment. Anselm left England in 1097 to complain to the pope in Rome and remained in Italy until the death of William Rufus.

Henry, William the Conqueror's third son, was crowned Henry I and proved himself one of England's best kings. He was an able soldier and even better diplomat. He was noted for fair dealing but heavy taxes and savage penalties. He recalled Anselm to be archbishop of Canterbury. Anselm approved the legality of Henry's marriage to Matilda (some claimed she had been a nun). Soon Anselm and Henry I clashed over investiture and the taxing of church property. Anselm forbade the clergy to receive lay investiture. Henry I would not hand over church lands unless he approved a candidate and the candidate was willing to go through the ceremony of homage as the king's vassal. Anselm went to Rome. Henry sent a mission to Rome to present his case to Pope Paschal. Henry declared that he would not give up investiture even to save his kingdom. Paschal declared that he would not give in, even to save his head. Neither would make concessions, and yet neither wanted a break. Finally, in 1107, two years before Anselm's death, a compromise was reached. Henry I agreed to give up the investiture with ring and staff. The King kept the right to nominate the prelate and to receive his homage as a feudal vassal. Both sides claimed victory, but in the end the king had the advantage.

THE SETTLEMENT OF INVESTITURE IN FRANCE:

The French kings had been notorious for simony. Philip I (1060-1108) was too weak to resist the reform party. Gregory VII had nothing but contempt for Philip. Both the king and his wife, Bertrada, sold church offices to the highest bidders. The popes through their legates carried on a great campaign against simony and marriage of the clergy. Philip I had to grant the reformers in 1107 that he would give up investiture with ring and staff and had to grant canonical elections. Once chosen, the candidates would receive the regalia from the king after giving him their oath of fealty.

THE CONCORDAT OF WORMS, 1122.

The world had grown tired of the Investiture Controversy. Two French leaders, Ivo, bishop of Chartres, and Hubo of Fleury, in writings between 1099 and 1106 had insisted that both state and church had their rights and spheres. The church was over the spiritual and the state was over the temporal. The Investiture involved both spiritual and temporal. They called for a compromise. The settlements in England and France showed the way and furnished examples.

Pope Calixtus II and King Henry V almost reached an agreement at Mouzon in north-eastern France in 1119. Distrust of the king led the pope to withdraw. A final agreement was reached at Worms on September 23, 1122. King and pope signed the Concordat of Worms. Free election was guaranteed. In Germany the election would be in the presence of the king. Election would be by the cathedral clergy. In a disputed election the king after consulting archbishops and bishops of the province would decide for the party with the greater right. After election the bishop would receive his regalia (the temporal possessions) by the touch of the
king's scepter, after doing homage and taking the oath of fealty as the king's vassal. The king renounced the right to confer ring and staff. After being invested with the regalia by the king, the bishop would be consecrated by the archbishop and invested with the spiritual means of the ring and staff conferred by the archbishop. In Italy canonical elections would be held and six months after consecration and investiture with ring and staff, the king would invest with the regalia. King and pope were to defend and protect the rights of the other. Imperial power was broken in Italy. In Germany the king by his presence still dominated the election. There would be no money payments for office. A newly elected bishop could not survive without the lands from the king. Since high clergy were usually sons of the nobility the king could hardly refuse the regalia. The concordat was in a measure a victory for the German feudal princes—the king would have to be tactful in dealing with them. The outlook for the German monarchy looked dark—the king had to buy favor with lands. The great theoretical dispute over supreme power was left undecided. The church had failed to establish its whole reform program. It had gained in prestige and power. It had made some headway with its program of chastity in the clergy and its program against simony. The papacy had not established its supremacy over the state but had established its supremacy within the church. It had vindicated its equality with the temporal power. It had invalidated the kings' claim to be God's consecrated agents on earth. The church still believed in its temporal supremacy and its right to command the whole of society. The church could not be ignored. The Concordat was a compromise and a temporary peace—the Church had not freed itself from the state. The battle would be renewed.